AMAMIHE: Journal of Applied Philosophy. Vol.18. No. 1. 2020. ISSN: 1597-0779
Department of Philosophy, Imo State University

THE CONTEXT OF IGWEBUIKE: WHAT ENTREPRENEURSHIP DEVELOPMENT SYSTEMS IN AFRICA CAN LEARN FROM THE IGBO APPRENTICESHIP SYSTEM

Catherine Chiugo Kanu, Ph.D
Department of Business Education
University of Nigeria, Nsukka
chiugokanu@yahoo.com

Abstract

Many African countries design and implement entrepreneurship development programmes (EDP) to empower their people and save their nations from poverty. These programmes, many of which are modeled after programmes that have succeeded in other parts of the world, often fail to fully realize their objectives as many of the businesses emerging from the programmes do not survive or perform as planned. This study looks inward to an indigenous model – The Igbo apprenticeship system (IAS), a popular model used in Nigeria, especially by people of the South East. The system has been recognized as the most successful business incubation platform in Africa and, arguably, in the world. Analysis of literature on IAS showed that complementarity was the secret behind the success of the IAS. The complementarity features of the IAS were identified and a descriptive survey was used to investigate whether integrating the complementarity features into EDP will be helpful in raising successful entrepreneurs. Subjects for the investigation were 92 entrepreneurs whose businesses emerged or benefited from entrepreneurship development programmes in Nigeria and has operated their businesses for at least one year. The subjects who were selected from South-West Nigeria, responded to a 30-item questionnaire. The questionnaire was validated by 5 experts and pre-tested. The pre-test result produced a Cronbach Alpha Reliability Coefficient of 0.87. Data collected in the study were analysed using frequency, percentage and mean. Results revealed that integrating the complementarity features of the IAS into EDP will be very helpful in creating more successful entrepreneurs. Based on this finding, sponsors and organisers of EDP need better understanding of the IAS and develop capacity to integrate its complementarity features. To facilitate the integration process for organisers of EDP, a framework for the integration was developed (based on the findings) and validated by three management experts.

Introduction

Complementarity, a relationship in which parties combine their strengths to improve each other's quality, is valuable and inimitable in business. Kanu (2017) refers to complementarity as the English equivalent of *Igwebuike*, a concept of Igbo origin that literarily means 'number (or multitude) is powerful'. According to Kanu, complementarity means that when human beings come together in solidarity, they are powerful. Thus, Kanu describes complementarity as a philosophy which understands life as a shared reality; a relationship in which case the two or more coming together makes each of them a complete whole. Integrating complementary resources provides an opportunity for businesses to create competitive advantages, enhance learning, develop new capabilities and provide attractive offerings to achieve longer-term firm performance (Harrison, Hitt, Hoskisson & Ireland, 2000; Majava, Isoherranen & Kess, 2013; The Economist Intelligence Unit, 2018 & Lang, 2019).

In this 21st century characterized by hypercompetitive business environments, globalized markets, technological complexity and more sophisticated consumers, it is very hard for a business to grow sustainably alone. Thus, business people need complementary relationships that can help them become locally and gobally competitive. True complementarity requires goals that are clear, unambiguous and inspiring; roles that are well-defined and motivating; norms that align with values of the people and are carefully observed to prevent parties from going out of alignment; characters who have what it takes to perform their roles and who are capable of benefiting from the relationship; and sound relationship – strong bond, effective communication, mutual trust, support, sharing/transferring knowledge and skills.

For a complementary relationship to be effective, goals which describe the targets at which efforts should be directed need to be clear, unambiguous and motivating. Numerous experimental studies conducted across decades show that well-defined goals influence human behaviour and improve performance (Locke, 1968; Ivancevich & Smith. 1981; Locke & Latham, 2002 & Asmus, Karl, Mohen and Reinhart, 2015) On the other hand, inadequately formulated goals can cause confusion and lead individuals, teams or a whole organisation in the wrong direction (Chattered Management Institute, 2014). Lock and Latham (as cited in Yong, 2017) outlined five principles of goal setting which are: challenge, commitment, task complexity and feedback while Moussa, Boyer and Newberry (2016) emphasized that goals should be motivating. Just as in the case of goals, poorly defined roles are barriers to high performance. Team members do better work when their roles are clear - they know how to do their jobs and why they are doing them (Society for Human Resource Management [SHRM], 2019). Thus, roles need to be assigned according to the skills and interest of each person (Meinert, 2017). Interest, hard work, resilience and teachability are critical success factors for business collaboration success. As Maxwell (2007) puts it, if one does not have interest in something, nothing about that thing will be interesting. Hard work is another important factor. This is because running a business (whether successful or not) is hard and requires hardwork (Patel, 2013). Hardwork and interest are not one-off requirements; they need to be sustained until all goals are achieved. For this reason, resilience is vital for weathering entrepreneurial storms. Vaillant (2003) states that resilience reflects individuals who metaphorically resemble a twig with a fresh green living core such that when twisted out of shape, the twig bends but it does not break; instead, it springs back and continues growing.

The goals, roles and other standards agreed by the parties form the norm which according to Meinert (2017), helps in managing decision making, communication and conflict. The norms need to be observed to prevent parties from going out of alignment. There is need to always check for alignment between what has been agreed upon and what is actually being done (Moussa, Boyer & Newberry, 2016; Meinert, 2017). Meinert suggests that an outside onlooker may help those in the relationship to see the gaps between what they are saying and what they are doing. In addition, since complementarity is about improving each other's quality, the parties need to have a strong bond, effective communication, trust and support each other). Lack of these elements are barriers to high performance (SHRM, 2019). Given the frequent occurrence of these elements– sharing, togetherness, unity, activeness/strength, trust, love, supportiveness and dependability – in African names, proverbs, folk tales, songs, symbols and mythology, Kanu argued that complementarity is not just at the heart of the African Philosophy but it is the inner and underlying principle of African philosophy as well as the manner of being in African Ontology. Given that complementarity is a natural part of Africans, African systems that have strong complementarity features succeed. A typical example of such system is the Igbo Apprenticeship System.

The Igbo apprenticeship Model (IAS) is a platform for informal practical business education and wealth creation. It is a model in which an established businessman takes up an apprentice and nurtures him to contribute to the growth of the business while developing capacity to manage his/her own business and, in the end, gives him start-up capital to start his/her own business (Okoro, 2018; Urugun and Nafiu, 2014; Kanu, 2019; Iwara, Amaechi & Netshandama, 2019). The IAS played a major role in pulling majority of Igbo families out of poverty within 30 months of the Biafra Civil War, in spite of the harsh 20 Pounds policy which said that only £20 be given to every Igbo person to survive on regardless of what they had in the bank before the war (Okoro, 2018 & Kanu, 2019). Considering the general economic status of the Igbo after the Nigeria/Biafra war, the economic achievement of the Igbo is significant (Iwara, Amaechi and Netshandama, 2019). Researchers agree that the Igbo business model is superior to those of other ethnic groups in Nigeria (Olutayo, 1999; Ukaegbu, 2003; Igbo, 2006; Orugun & Nafiu, 2014; Onwuka, 2015; Obunike, 2016, Kanu, 2017 and Neuwirth, 2017) and the system has been recognized as the backbone of the Nigerian Economy (Orugun & Nafiu, 2014). In Lagos which is Nigeria's economic capital, Igbo businesses accounts for the 74% of all investments according to Maliga (2013) in Iwara et al (2019). Thus, Neuwirth (2017), based on his findings at the Alaba international market, describes the system as the largest business incubation platform in the world.

On the other hand, entrepreneurship programmes that do not have strong complementarity features struggle endlessly. Majority of the entrepreneurship programmes in Africa fall within this category. In the last ten years, Nigerian Government has implemented several entrepreneurship development programmes such as Youth Enterprise with Innovation in Nigeria (YouWIN); Youth Entrepreneurship Support (YES); and TraderMoni. These trends are found in other African countries such as Ethiopia, Tanzania, Zambia and Kenya (Kopf, 2018). African governments spend so much money on these programmes. In Nigeria for example, Federal Government has budgeted and, perhaps, spent about ₦100 billion in funding entrepreneurship development programmes in the last ten years (Olagunju, 2016, McKenzie, 2015; Premium times, 2018, Nwafor, 2018; TraderMoni, 2018, BOI, 2018, McKenzie, 2019). The Billions were given to Millions of Nigerians as loans or grants to start new businesses or expand existing ones (McKenzie, 2015; Bank of Industry, 2018; Premiumtimes, 2018 & Nwafor, 2018). News sources confirm that Over $20 million will be disbursed to Kenyan entrepreneurs who would emerge from a business plan competition similar to Nigeria's YouWIN in 2019 (Kopf, 2018, OFA, 2019).

Many of the programmes depend on the quality of business plans submitted in deciding the candidates that are suitable and those that are not. However, a personal observation of some entrepreneurship programmes show that (1) some carriers of excellent business plans did not understand the contents of the plans they carry because they did not participate adequately in writing the plans (2) given that candidates are required to write "bankable" business plan, with which judges will predict their entrepreneurial success to decide whether or not to fund the proposal, some candidates move ahead to predict the areas of interest to the judges and then write business plans in those areas so that the judges will approve the business plans. It is, therefore, not surprising that a follow-up study of YouWIN conducted by McKenzie and Sansone (2019) revealed that business plan scores from judges are uncorrelated with business survival, employment, sales, or profits. Besides, entrepreneurship is not a scholastic endeavour. Therefore, being brilliant enough to write good business plan is good but not enough to predict entrepreneurial success. There are factors that are more critical and foundational to business success such as having interest in entrepreneurship as well as having the behavioral pattern required for running a business successfully. Some selected candidates do not have genuine interest in entrepreneurship and do not have capacity to do business but joined the entrepreneurship programme because of unemployment challenge. In addition, some entrepreneurship programmes have objectives that are ambiguous or unbelievable. For instance, the commendable goal of the TraderMoni programme designed to provide support to petty traders and artisans was mistaken for a political move (Nwafor, 2018). In cases where goals are not clear or where people do not believe that the stated goal is the real goal, they are likely to take the funds given to them (whether grant or loan) as part of their share of the "National Cake" and not as money for starting or expanding business. The confusion created by ambiguous goals and objectives reduces the commitment of parties to each other as well as the commitment to programme goals. The reduced commitment is usually worsened by a change of administration.

Owing to the above programme design problems, many of the businesses fail to perform as expected or shut down completely. A follow-up study on YouWIN conducted by McKenzie (2015) revealed that the sponsored businesses under YouWIN 2011 edition did not appear to have resulted in a change in the sectors the individuals operate in, nor in the education and initial wealth profiles of the entrepreneurs who operate the businesses. In a 2016 study, McKenzie found that about a quarter of the sponsored businesses had closed down and, majority of the businesses remaining had low sales. Similar results were obtained from entrepreneurship programme follow-up researches in other parts of Africa such as Uganda (Blattman et al., (2014) and Ghana (Fafchamp & Woodruff, 2014). Besides these empirical evidence, the millions of new/expanded businesses are yet to positively impact on the country's unemployment and poverty status. Instead, poverty and unemployment are on the rise (Obanya, 2016) and there are no signs of slowing down (Brookings Institution & World Poverty Clock as cited in Okogba, 2019).

There has been calls to integrate the Igbo apprenticeship model into contemporary entrepreneurial development programmes in order to boost their success rates (Orugun and Nafiu (2014), Obunike, 2016; Chinweuba and Ezeugwu, 2017; Okoro, 2018 and Iwara, et al 2019). However, some of the scholars were concerned that the IAS cannot be easily replicated or integrated (Neuwirth 2017; Okoro, 2018; Iwara et al, 2019) and thus, the very important call for integration has not been answered. This is partly because there is little knowledge about what exactly to integrate. This study is designed to provide some clarity regarding the integration of the model. It analyzed literature on IAS to identify the features that make it successful and then sought the opinions of new entrepreneurs created through EDPs about the helpfulness of integrating the identified features. The following research questions guided this study.

1. What complementarity features of the Igbo apprenticeship model will be helpful in raising successful entrepreneurs if integrated into entrepreneurship development programmes in Africa?

2. Is there a significant difference in the mean responses of entrepreneurs who were supported with grants and those supported with loans on the complementarity features of the IAS that would be helpful in raising successful entrepreneurs if integrated into entrepreneurship development programme in Africa?

Programme organisers considering the integration of the model into the programme could use findings from this study and follow the framework developed to support successful implementation.

The Nature of Entrepreneurship Development Programmes in Africa

Entrepreneurship development programmes in Africa are usually organised by governments through their ministries and agencies as part of their strategies to create new jobs (BOI, 2018, Kopf, 2018). Sometimes, government partner with other organisations such as World Bank, commercial banks, business schools and vocational training centers to provide funding, skill training and mentoring to promising entrepreneurial candidates (McKenzie, 2015, BOI, 2018; Kopf, 2018). The table below provides insights into the nature of entrepreneurship programmes in Nigeria. It summarises the characteristics of four recent entrepreneurship development programmes - Youth Enterprise with Innovation in Nigeria (YouWIN); Graduate Entrepreneurship Fund (GEF); Youth Entrepreneurship Support (YES) and TraderMoni.

Table 2: Nature of modern entrepreneurship development programmes in Nigeria

	YouWIN	**Graduate Entrepreneurship Fund**	**Youth Entrepreneurship Support**	**TraderMoni**
Year of Launch	2011	2015	2016	2018
Sponsors / Organisers	Ministries of Finance, Communication Technology and Youth Development; DFID; World Bank	Bank of Industry National Youth Service Corps (NYSC)	Bank of Industry Federal Ministry of Trade and investment	Bank of Industry monitored by the Vice President of Nigeria
Goal/ Objectives	Encourage innovation and job creation	encourage NYSC members to venture into business and become employers rather than job seekers	equipping young people with the requisite skills and knowledge to be self-employed by starting and managing their own businesses..	expand existing small businesses and create new jobs
Targets/ Beneficiaries	Nigerians living in Nigeria, 18-40Yrs (1st & 3rd Editions) 18 – 45 yrs. (2nd Edition); Post-secondary qualification; Already Midwifed 3,900 enterprises	Serving members of NYSC estimated 1,000 enterprises promoted by NYSC members across the country.	18 – 35 years Targets 5000 youths Minimum of OND	2 million Petty traders and artisans

Budget/ spending	1st edition - 12bn for 1200 people 2nd edition (women only) - About 12bn for 1200 people 3rd Edition - N15bn - N22.5bn for 1500 people	N2.0 billion in the first year (Budget)	N10 billion (budget)	2 million people to receive the loan across 36 states of Nigeria before end of 2018
Support: Type and amount per candidate	Grant 10 -15million	Loan (9% interest) N500,000 – N2million	Loan (9% Interest) for 3-5 years 1% Processing fee N5 Million each (Maximum)	Loan (interest and collateral free) N10,000 – N100,000
Other Requests	Bankable business plan; Registration with CAC; effective Communication in English	bankable business ideas within BOI's SME clusters	competencies for starting and managing their own businesses, business plan	None
Capacity Building Programme	Four-day business plan training.	4-day intensive training on generating business idea, how to run a profitable business and basic financial record keeping	8 weeks online and 5days in-class on training on entrepreneurship and business management Technical training in Technical and vocational institutions	None

Source: McKenzie, 2015; BOI, 2015; Onuba, 2016; Olagunju, 2016; BOI, 2018; TraderMoni, 2018; Nwafor, 2018; Premium times, 2018)

Features of the Igbo apprenticeship system

The Igbo apprenticeship system is also known as "*Igba-Boi*,which literarily means "to serve". In this context, however, Igba boi is not used in its literal sense whereby the only purpose is total servitude to the master (Iwara, Amaechi & Netshandama, 2019). Instead, it is a process whereby someone is being trained in entrepreneurship (Agozino & Anyanike, 2007). The feature of the Igbo apprenticeship system is as follows:

The people: The Igbo apprenticeship system (IAS) is anchored on the people's recognition of the need for one another; their spirit of resilience as well as their think-home-philosophy. The doggedness, perseverance solidarity among the business people within the system are some of the reasons the system thrives (Olutayo, 1999). The Igbo apprenticeship system (IAS) is made up of highly energetic, hardworking, tolerant and flexible people who desire result for their work (Burdus as cited in Orugun & Nafiu, 2014). A study conducted by Iwara, et al (2019) on the Igbo apprenticeship system revealed that when an apprentice arrives, his/her willingness to learn, resilience and trustworthiness are assessed to determine whether the apprentice stays or sent home after the first few months. An apprentice who does not have the important qualities is sent home within the first three months (Iwara, et al. 2019). The system has no tolerance for laziness, pride and untrustworthiness. This was well captured in an excerpt from an interview with a master in Iwara et al (2019):

> "I immediately realize that a child can do well in entrepreneurship by working with him/her for one week." During this short period, I watch and evaluate their level of devotion, smartness, perseverance and humbleness. I can easily tell and decide to send them parking if they lack requisite qualities"

The community: One of the reasons the Master/Apprentice relationship succeeds is the fact that the relationship is not just between master and apprentice but is a community affair. Community members usually know about the relationship and that this usually puts some checks on the behaviour of the master and his apprentice, for instance, a master that dismisses an apprentice after some years of service on grounds that are not substantiated or fails to keep to the terms of apprenticeship after the agreed number of years of service incurs the wrath of the community back at home (Kanu, 2019). Family and community members are usually carried along till the end of the relationship, thus, at the end of the apprenticeship, the master brings the apprentice home and gives him a take-off fund in the presence of family members (Okoro).

Relationship: There is usually a strong bond between master and apprentice. According to Kanu (2019), the apprentice is the son or daughter of the master; he leaves his parents and comes to live under the care and supervision of his master and serves him for about 5 - 7 years. The apprentice does every chore that the master assigns including chores relating to the home and there are no strict rules about what a mentee can do at mentor's house What is important is that the apprentice in question is taught the basic ways of living, against what he/she may have known before they arrived (Iwara et al. 2019). According Kanu (2019), The apprentice does not travel home without the consent of the master and he works hard to win the trust and favour of his master. As Iwara et al. found, trustworthiness is an important quality to entrepreneurs in the system. Therefore, during the years of apprenticeship, every established acts of theft, diversion of fund and flamboyant use and wastage of business finances terminates the arrangement.

Education: Aleke (2018) describes the education received within the Igbo apprenticeship system (IAS) as informally formal, but raw and practical cutthroat business education". (Comparing the IAS with modern incubation platforms, Aleke noted that, unlike modern business incubation platforms, the IAS offers entrepreneurial development opportunities in real environment of high stakes business where profits and loss hold a premium. Iwara et al (2019) also found that if an apprentice passes the initial test and is retained, he/she enters the nurturing stage during which the master teaches him about market competitiveness system, market language and bargaining strategy, how to maximize entrepreneurial opportunities, customer relationship, and how to deal with innovation. Iwara et al stated that these practices help the apprentice in his growth and development. As the apprentice increases in skill and experience, his master introduces him to management and leadership roles as the apprentice sometimes manages new branches for his master, negotiating for him and representing him in meetings with international partners (Okoro, 2018; Kanu, 2019). This gives room for trust, exposure and confidence-building (Okoro, 2018).

Sharing: To Neuwirth (2017), the strength of the IAS lies in their sharing principle. In a TED Talk, Neuwirth narrates his experience from a physical visit to the Alaba International Market in Lagos which is dominated by the Igbos:

> "…it's the largest electronics market in West Africa. It's 10,000 merchants, they do about four billion dollars of turnover every year." "this market is governed by a sharing principle. Every merchant, when you ask them, "How did you get started in global trade?" they say, "Well, when my master settled me." And when I finally got it into my

> head to ask, "What is this 'settling?'" it turns out that when you've done your apprenticeship with someone you work for, they are required — required — to set you up in business. That means paying your rent for two or three years and giving you a cash infusion so you can go out in the world and start trading"

The relationship between the master and apprentice in IAS is not a relationship where a mentee receives training without giving back to the master; it is rather a complementary relationship where apprentice must contribute to the growth of his master's business and work hard to win his trust and favour. Thus, the parties contribute to each other's progress. This relationship does not end with the settlement of the apprentice. The apprentice, even after he has been settled, continues to receive support from his master such as accommodation, feeding, credit facilities (Neuwirth, 2017) and assistance with importation. This post-settlement support ensures that the apprentice succeeds in his own business. As soon as the apprentice finds his feet in the business, he is expected to do for others what his master did for him (Kanu, 2019). This creates a circle which Kanu (2019) describes as a continuous beautiful circle, with each preparing for the birth of a millionaire.

The Igbo apprenticeship system has been criticized for not having rigorous apprenticeship selection procedure. Aleke (2018) stated that unlike modern incubation platforms, the Igbo apprenticeship system gives chances without core evaluation and thus, takes in mavericks and rejects sometimes, hoping to give them a future. In addition, Iwara et al. 2019) were concerned that there is usually no written laws and agreements that may be relied upon for legal action. This is especially in situations when a master refuses to give the apprentice a take-off fund or when an apprentice defrauds his master. Chinweuba and Ezeugwu, (2017) also noted that IAS takes in apprentice in their early ages and so deny them the opportunity of continuing their education. However, even though the IAS recruit people without thorough assessment, the system throws out apprentice who do not have what it takes to succeed in entrepreneurship within few months of boarding (Iwara et al. 2019). With respect to documentation of laws, Kanu, 2019, explained that although there are no clearly written laws, the system succeeds because the apprentice is careful, knowing that if he fails or ruins his master's business, his own future would be ruined as his master would not be able to give him a start-up fund for his own business. Kanu further explained that insincere masters who do not give their apprentice start-up for no just cause run the risks of having their businesses ruined by the apprentice's personal deity, the *Chi*. Kanu also states that such master usually have difficulty in getting another apprentice as the story is told of every master's treatment of his apprentice in his home community from generation to generation. The story is also and in the environment where his business operates. Given these reasons, every master does his best to give take-off fund to his apprentice at the end of his service.

The view of Chinweuba and Ezeugwu, (2017) on IAS denying apprentices schooling is contrary to the views of Chrisent (2019) and Kanu (2019) Chriscent and Kanu (2019) noted that Igbos have a culture that frowns at the young roaming the streets in idleness, hence, the apprenticeship system helps to ensure that if a child is unable to go to school for any reason, instead of staying back at home and roaming about, he learns a trade. Most of the teenagers joining the IAS chose the option themselves and, nowadays, unemployment, poverty and school failure are driving more young people to pursue entrepreneurship early. They are discouraged when they see people who have university degrees but are unemployed or poor and financially dependent. They are even more discouraged when they see people with university degrees who are not only unemployed and poor but are also not intellectually sound and thus, cannot contribute financially or intellectually to solving family or societal problems. These sights make boys who do not have sufficient passion for schooling to follow the path of entrepreneurship as soon as possible. Neuwirth (2017) noted that the Igbo multi billionaires such as Innoson, Coscharis, Ibeto and Chikason some of whom did not venture anywhere near the gates of secondary school are products of the Igbo apprenticeship system and control multi-billion dollar empires. No wonder, Kanu (2019) argues that the Igbo apprenticeship system has produced more millionaires and billionaires than the entire Nigerian University economic system in Nigeria has produced.

Igbo Apprenticeship System and Entrepreneurship Development programmes in Nigeria: Where are the differences?

The table below summarizes the differences between the Igbo Apprenticeship system and Entrepreneurship development programmes in terms of complementarity

Table 1*: Summary of the differences between the Igbo Apprenticeship system and Entrepreneurship development programmes in terms of complementarity*

Factor	**Igbo Apprenticeship System**	**Entrepreneurship Development Programmes in Africa**
Goals and Objectives	▪ Although unwritten, goal is unmistakable ▪ Aligned with needs and interest of the parties	▪ Sometimes clear; Sometimes controversial and mistakable ▪ Sometimes sponsors and aspiring entrepreneurs do not have genuine interest
Roles and Responsibilities	▪ Clearly defined and motivating ▪ Has consequence for non-performance ▪ Beneficiaries are expected to give back to the their masters and to society	▪ Sometimes clear ▪ No consequence for nonperformance by any party ▪ Beneficiaries are not required to give back
Norms/ Culture	▪ Norm has been developed over decades ▪ Most times, master and apprentice are from same community. Community has high interest in the relationship and looks forward to a successful closure.	▪ No norm ▪ There is no outside onlooker ensuring that what is agreed is what is being done. Change in governments reduces interest and commitment of sponsors and organisers to programme success
Apprentice	▪ Genuinely interested in entrepreneurship ▪ Young, energetic, resilient, flexible and open to improvements	▪ May not be interested in entrepreneurship ▪ May be too mature and not very flexible and teachable
Mentor Entrepreneurs	▪ Always successful practicing entrepreneurs with skill and experience	▪ Mentor entrepreneurs may be from business schools or banks who do not have practical business experience and skill

Relationship	▪ Mentor entrepreneur and apprentice need each other. ▪ Apprentice is required to support the mentor entrepreneur ▪ Strong bond - Apprentice is like a son or daughter of the master and lives with the mentor entrepreneur ▪ No legal documents. Totally driven by trust and credibility	▪ Mentor entrepreneur has no need for the apprentice who is meant to receive and not to give back ▪ No strong bond ▪ Most times, parties prepare and sign legal agreements
Support	▪ Mentor entrepreneur transfers huge knowledge and skills to his apprentice without any reservation ▪ Continues to support the apprentice even after the settlement until the apprentice is properly settled in his own business	▪ Transfer of knowledge and skills is limited or not done at all. ▪ Support and follow-up is limited especially when government changes

Theoretical background

Goal setting theory

Goal setting theory was propounded by Edwin Locke in 1968 to explain why people behave the way they do in specific work situations. The theory states that goals and intentions drive human behavior and are determined by values and beliefs. The theory was created based on five principles – clarity, challenge, task complexity, commitment and feedback. The theory explains that specific goals generate higher levels of performance than ambiguous ones and also argue that challenging goals drive people to work hard and motivate them to achieve better performance, improve their skills and reap greater rewards (Free Management E-book [FME], 2013 & Young, 2017). However, goals need to be reasonably challenging - not too easy and not impossible to achieve. There needs to be an accurate balance to guarantee the right level of challenge as goals that are either too easy or too difficult negatively influence the motivation and decrease performance (Sari, 2018). In addition, the parties need to be committed to the goals and constructive feedback is necessary to help people improve in areas where they are weak. This theory is relevant to this study because in all complementarities, clear and motivating goals is the foundation for success.

Theory of Cognitive Apprenticeship

Cognitive apprenticeship is an instructional design theory developed by Collins, Brown, and Newman in 1989. The cognitive apprenticeship theory is an instructional model in which the master transfers knowledge and skills to apprentice through six steps (1) by demonstrating the desired performance of a task explicitly while the student observes and builds a conceptual model of the task (Modelling), (2) observing the novice perform the task while providing hints and feedback (coaching) (3) applying strategies and methods to support learning as well as helping with aspects of the task that the student could not do yet (scaffolding) (4) getting students to articulate their knowledge and reasoning of the task (articulation) (5) getting students to reflect upon their knowledge and understanding (Reflection) and (6) encouraging students to explore new ways in which they can apply what they learnt (exploration). This model is relevant for this study because it describes the kind of training that can work in programmes looking to raise successful entrepreneurs. In entrepreneurial education, there are some tacit, subtle strategies and techniques that cannot be effectively learnt from virtual or actual classrooms; the apprentice needs to be with a master in the real work environment to learn them.

Methodology

The study used a descriptive survey design method. Purposive and snowball sampling techniques were used to identify 92 managers of businesses created through or supported by Federal Government-sponsored entrepreneurship development programmes (EDPs). The businesses selected for the study were those that are at least one-year-old. Purposive sampling technique was used to identify 21 managers who participated in Federal government-sponsored entrepreneurship development programmes and received financial support (grant or loan) to start or expand their businesses in Lagos and Ogun states. These initial 21 managers referred the researcher and research assistant to 71 more entrepreneurs who received grant or loan from government-sponsored EDPs and who are operating at least one-year-old businesses in Lagos and Ogun states. The study was conducted outside the South Eastern part of Nigeria to avoid bias opinion. In addition, the questionnaire presented the features without mentioning that they were derived from the Igbo apprenticeship system to ensure that respondents do not have biased opinions about the items. The questionnaire was researcher-generated and was used as instrument for collecting primary data for this study. Secondary data was gathered from physical and online journals, books, blogs and other news sources.

The questionnaire had two sections – A and B. Section A contained six (6) items on respondents' demography and business performance status (Age, Sex, years of experience in business, sector/industry, type of financial support received and status of business performance compared with business plan). Section B had 24 items on complementarity features of the Igbo apprenticeship system that could be integrated into EDPs for raising more successful entrepreneurs. For section A, possible options were provided and respondents were asked to check the one that applies to them while for section B, respondents were requested to indicate their opinion regarding the degree of helpfulness of integrating the items into entrepreneurship development programmes for raising successful entrepreneurs. They were asked to check (1) Not helpful at all (2) Not helpful (3) Not sure (4) Helpful (5) Very Helpful. The questionnaire was face validated by 5 experts in the areas of Business Education, Management and African Studies. To determine the internal consistency of the questionnaire, it was trial-tested using 15 business owners who were supported by Federal Government-sponsored entrepreneurship development programmes operating their businesses in Oyo State. The results showed no ambiguity in the instrument and produced a Cronbach Alpha Reliability Coefficient (for internal consistency reliability) of 0.87.

The questionnaire was administered by the researcher and one research assistant who was engaged to enhance timely distribution and collection of questionnaires. The research assistant was briefed on the research objectives as well as when and how to approach the subjects in order to get their cooperation. In addition, the research assistant was taught to explain the individual items on the questionnaire should the subjects require explanations. Out of the 92 managers who completed the questionnaire, 73 copies of the questionnaire were properly completed and retrieved, representing 79% retrieval rate.

Frequency and percentage were used to analyse the data gathered with section A while Mean and standard deviation were used to analyse data gathered with section B. For section B, values were assigned to the Likert scale response categories as follows: Not helpful at all - 1.00 to 1.49; Not helpful – 1.50 to 2.49; Not sure – 2.50 to 3.49; Helpful – 3.50 to 4.49; Very helpful - 4.50 to 5.00. Standard deviation (SD) was used to measure the dispersion of variability of the responses from the mean. Large SD (i.e. SD of 1 and above) show that opinions of the respondents vary significantly from one another while small SDs imply that respondents' opinions did not vary much. The difference in the responses of entrepreneurs supported by grant and those supported by loans was tested using t-test at 0.05 level of significance. This computation was done using the Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) Version 22.0.

Results

Table 3: Respondent Demographics

		Frequency	Percent
Age	Below 30years	36	49.3
	30 - 40years	32	43.8
	Above 45years	5	6.8
Sex	Male	58	79.5
	Female	15	20.5
Years of experience in business	Below 2 years	40	54.8
	2 – 5 years	32	43.8
	Above 5 years	1	1.4
Sector/Industry	Agriculture	29	39.7
	ICT	18	24.7
	Manufacturing	18	24.7
	Others	8	11.0
Type of financial support	Grant	17	23.3
	Loan	56	76.7
Business performance (Compared to business plan)	Performing better than planned	2	2.7
	Performing as planned	18	24.7
	Trying to perform as planned	53	72.6

Table three shows that about half of the respondents were below the age of 30 years while only few (6.8 percent) were above 45 years. The respondents were more of males (79.5 percent) and that two in every five have been in business for less than two years. It reveals that majority (76.7%) were supported with loans and the rest with grants (23.3 percent). The table also shows that about three in every 4 are struggling to perform as planned.

Research Question 1

What complementarity features of the Igbo apprenticeship system will be helpful in raising successful entrepreneurs if integrated into entrepreneurship development programmes in Africa?

Table 4: Features of the Igbo Apprenticeship System that can be adapted to Entrepreneurship Development Programmes

S/No	Items	Mean	SD	Decision
1	Goals are clear	4.38	0.62	Helpful
2	Goals are motivating	4.30	0.64	Helpful
3	Roles are clearly defined	4.67	0.56	Very Helpful
4	Roles are inspiring	4.37	0.72	Helpful
5	Apprentices have interest in entrepreneurship	4.31	0.88	Helpful
6	Apprentices are resilient	4.80	0.40	Very Helpful
7	Apprentices are hardworking	4.73	0.45	Very Helpful
8	Apprentices are teachable	4.47	0.58	Helpful
9	Mentor entrepreneurs are successful entrepreneurs with practical experience in business	4.66	0.56	Very Helpful
10	Mentor entrepreneurs are willing to nurture new entrepreneurs	4.41	0.68	Helpful
11	Mentor entrepreneur's business is in the area of interest of the Apprentice	4.49	0.56	Helpful
12	Mentor entrepreneur does not attempt to lure or force Apprentice to remain in his company beyond agreed date	4.20	0.85	Helpful
13	A network of entrepreneurs that emerged through EDPs observing nurturing programmes and making inputs to programme goals	4.31	0.57	Helpful
14	Apprentices work in Mentor entrepreneur's establishment on full-time basis during the training programme	4.30	0.59	Helpful
15	Apprentices are required to contribute	4.44	0.73	Helpful

	significantly to growth of Mentor entrepreneurs' business during their training programme			
16	First and last meeting of Mentor entrepreneur and Apprentice to be convened and attended by an experienced member of the organizing body of the entrepreneurship programme	4.48	0.63	Helpful
17	Negative reports (e.g. Truancy, theft, inability to learn) terminates the programme	4.70	0.57	Very Helpful
18	Mentor entrepreneurs help Mentor entrepreneurs acquire skills in different aspects of the business	4.79	0.41	Very Helpful
19	Apprentices are exposed to management and leadership roles as they mature in their training	4.77	0.46	Very Helpful
20	Mentor entrepreneurs continue to support Apprentices remotely after training has ended until they stabilize in their businesses	4.62	0.49	Very Helpful
21	Mentor entrepreneurs' Report on Apprentice performance should be a major consideration in the final assessment of the Mentor entrepreneur for funding	4.72	0.28	Very Helpful
22	Entrepreneurs emerging from the programme are automatically responsible for nurturing up-coming entrepreneurs	4.80	0.40	Very Helpful
23	There are no legal agreement to guide the Mentor entrepreneur-Apprentice relationship.	2.22	0.67	Not Helpful
	Grand mean	**4.53**	**0.12**	**Very Helpful**

Table 4 shows that overall, respondents are of the opinion that the complementarity features of the Igbo apprenticeship system will be very helpful in raising successful entrepreneurs if integrated into entrepreneurship development programmes having obtained a grand mean of 4.53. Respondents are of the opinion that one out of the 23 complementarity features identified (there are no legal agreements to guide Mentor entrepreneur-Apprentice relationship) will not be helpful if integrated. Two items had the highest mean score of 4.80 - Items 6 (Apprentices are resilient) and 22 (Entrepreneurs emerging from the programme are automatically responsible for nurture up-coming entrepreneurs) had the highest mean score of 4.80.

Research question 2*:* Is there a significant difference in the mean responses of entrepreneurs who were supported with grants and those supported with loans on the complementarity features of the IAS that would be helpful in raising successful entrepreneurs if integrated into entrepreneurship development programme in Africa?

Data for answering research question 2 are presented in Table 2

Table 4*: T-test of the Mean Responses of Entrepreneurs Supported with Grants and Entrepreneurs Supported with Loans on the complementarity features of the Igbo apprenticeship system that will be helpful to aspiring entrepreneurs in Entrepreneurship*

Development Programme in Africa

S/N	Items	X_1	S_1	X_2	S_2	P-value	Remarks
1	Goals are clear	4.41	0.51	4.38	0.65	.831	NS
2	Goals are motivating	4.24	0.44	4.32	0.69	.630	NS
3	Roles are clearly defined	4.71	0.59	4.65	0.55	.742	NS
4	Roles are inspiring	4.53	0.62	4.32	0.74	.298	NS
5	Apprentices have interest in entrepreneurship	3.89	1.22	4.45	0.71	**.020**	**S**
6	Apprentices are resilient	4.76	0.44	4.82	0.39	.609	NS
7	Apprentices are hardworking	4.65	0.49	4.75	0.44	.412	NS
8	Apprentices are teachable	4.82	0,39	4.36	0.59	.003	S
9	Mentor entrepreneurs are successful entrepreneurs with practical experience in business	5.00	0.00	4.55	0.60	**.003**	**S**
10	Mentor entrepreneurs are willing to nurture new entrepreneurs	4.18	0.64	4.48	0.69	.107	NS
11	Mentor entrepreneur's business is in the area of interest of Apprentice	4.41	0.62	4.51	0.54	.494	NS

12	Mentor entrepreneur does not attempt to lure or force Apprentice to remain in his/her firm company after the agreed date	4.18	0.64	4.21	0.91	.874	NS
13	A network entrepreneurs that emerged through EDPs observing nurturing programmes and making inputs to programmes goals	3.88	0.60	4.45	0.50	**.000**	**S**
14	Apprentices work in Mentor entrepreneur's establishment on full-time basis throughout the duration of the training	3.71	0.47	4.48	0.50	**.000**	**S**
15	Apprentices contribute significantly to growth of Mentor entrepreneurs' business during the training programme	3.65	0.79	4.68	0.51	**.000**	**S**
16	First and last meetings of Mentor entrepreneur and Apprentice to be convened and attended by an experienced member of the organization	3.76	0.56	4.70	0.46	**.000**	**S**
17	Negative reports (e.g. Truancy, theft, inability to learn) terminates the programme	5.00	0.50	4.60	0.56	**.012**	**S**
18	Mentor entrepreneurs help Apprentices acquire skills in different aspects of the business	4.76	0.44	4.80	0.40	.733	NS
19	Apprentices are exposed to management and leadership roles as they mature in the training	4.94	0.24	4.7143	0.49	.073	NS
20	Mentor entrepreneurs continue to support Apprentices post training until they stabilize in their businesses	4.59	0.51	4.63	0.49	.788	NS
21	Mentor entrepreneurs' report on Apprentice performance should be a major consideration in the final assessment of the Apprentice for funding	4.94	0.24	4.91	0.29	.694	NS
22	Entrepreneur emerging from the programme are automatically responsible for nurturing up-coming	4.76	0.44	4.82	0.39	.609	NS

	entrepreneurs						
23	There are no legal agreements to guide relationships	3.28	0.65	3.38	0.79	.108	NS

Key: *X_1 = Mean of entrepreneurs supported by Grant*
X_2 =Mean of entrepreneurs supported by Loan
S_1= Standard deviation of entrepreneurs supported by Grant
S_2 = Standard deviation of entrepreneurs supported by Loan
Df = 71
P = 0.05
S = Significant
NS = Not Significant

Table 4 shows that 15 out of 23 items had their p-values above 0.05 which indicated that there was no significant difference in the mean responses of entrepreneurs supported with grants and those supported with loans on the helpfulness of integrating the 15 features into entrepreneurship development programmes in Africa. The remaining eight items had their p-values less than 0.05 at 71 degree of freedom which indicated that there was a significant difference in the mean responses of entrepreneurs supported with loans and those supported with grant on complementarity features of the IAS that are applicable to entrepreneurship development programmes in Africa.

Discussion of findings

The study revealed that having clear, unambiguous and time-bound goals for entrepreneurship development programmes will help candidates in becoming more successful. This finding is consonant with the Chattered Management of Institute (2014) which states that well-formulated goals enable team members avoid confusion and lead individuals, teams or a whole organisation in the right direction. Analysis also revealed that it would be helpful if goals are motivating. This agrees with Moussa, Boyer and Newberry, 2016) who emphasised the need for goals to be motivating. Indeed, it is only when goals are motivating that team members will put in their very best in achieving the goal. The issues of clarity and motivation also apply to roles. Thus, the study found that it is helpful for roles to be clearly defined and inspiring to parties.

The study found that it would be helpful to select participants who have the essential characteristics. It found that programmes would raise more successful entrepreneurs if selected apprentices have interest in entrepreneurship. This finding agrees with Maxwell, 2007 which stated that if one is not interested in something, nothing about it will be interesting. Thus, Interest is fundamental as excellent entrepreneurial performance cannot be expected from someone who has little or no interest in entrepreneurship. The study also found that having Apprentices who are hardworking and resilient would be helpful in ensuring that entrepreneurship development programmes raise successful entrepreneurs. This finding agrees with Patel (2013) who states that entrepreneurship is hard and requires hard work. In entrepreneurship, especially for start-ups, hard work is a critical success factor and there is no alternative to hardwork. However, to suit some entrepreneurs who want to get plenty from doing little, some business teachers began to teach the concept of working smart rather than working hard. Hardwork and smartness are both good but smartness cannot substitute hardwork, not even in a gambling business. The two are rather complementary; entrepreneurs need to be smart in their hard work in order to get the best possible output.

In the same vein, it takes resilience to weather entrepreneurial storms. The description of resilient people by Vaillant (2003) as individuals who metaphorically resemble a twig with a fresh green living core is very applicable to entrepreneurship. As Vaillant explained, when such twigs are twisted out of shape, the twig bends but does not break; instead, it springs back and continues growing. The green core is a must-have for new entrepreneurs. Establishing and running a business does not present a single tough challenge but series of different challenges at every stage of the journey presents a new and different challenge. With each challenge bending the entrepreneur to a different direction, it is only a green core as in Valliant's description that can keep the entrepreneur going and growing; those whose core are dry and brittle get broken after very few bends and there is nothing that dries the core faster than lack of interest and laziness.

On the part of the mentor entrepreneur, the study found that it would be very helpful to have mentor entrepreneurs who are successful practicing entrepreneurs and who are willing to nurture the Apprentices and let them go at the agreed time. What apprentices need is practical knowledge and skills in a particular kind of business and, it is only a master who is skilled and experienced in the area that can provide such skills.

The study revealed that it would be helpful for entrepreneurs emerging from this system to form a network for the purpose of nurturing up-coming entrepreneurs, observing nurturing programmes to provide feedback and ensure they are aligned with goals. The network would create a community that could have steadier interest in entrepreneurial development support of new entrepreneurs. This will, take care of moments when organisers and their sponsors become less interested in the programme such as when they have new priorities or when there is a change of government. This finding is in line with the ideas of Moussa, Boyer and Newberry (2016) which stated that there should be no gap between goals and actual behaviours. It also agrees with Meinert (2017) who argued that there is need to ensure that parties are actually doing what they agreed and suggests that an outside onlooker may be helpful in helping the parties align their behaviours with agreements. In the Igbo apprenticeship system, the community plays this role for the master and his apprentice since in most cases, both come from the same community. Kanu (2019) found that the involvement of the community in the relationship ensures that masters and apprentices do what is agreed upon.

It was found that it would be very helpful for entrepreneurs emerging from entrepreneurship development systems to automatically become responsible for nurturing up-coming entrepreneurs. This finding is similar to findings of Kanu (2019) on the Igbo apprenticeship system. Kanu found that as soon as an apprentice settles down in his own business, he is expected to do for others what his master did for him and that creates a cycle of successful entrepreneurs consistently turning out successful entrepreneurs. The study revealed that it would be helpful if apprentices work in mentor's establishment on full time and make significant contribution to the growth of the mentor's business. It was also found that it would be very helpful if negative reports about the apprentice such as truancy theft or inability to learn terminates the nurturing programme. These findings have been identified as some of the features that make the IAS very successful (Okoro, 2018; Kanu, 2019; Iwara, et al. 2019). These findings along with the finding that it would be very helpful for trainers to teach apprentices the various aspects of the business including management and leadership would help in creating truly complementary relationship that is highly beneficial for both mentors and their apprentices while at the same time, equipping apprentices with knowledge, skills and attitudes they need to succeed in their own business. This finding is similar to those of Iwara, et al. (2019) that on the Igbo apprenticeship system. Iwara et al. (2019) found that the comprehensive training the master gives to the apprentice contributes to the apprentice's growth and development.

The study revealed a significant difference in the mean responses of entrepreneurs supported with cash and those supported with loan on 6 items, while the rest were not significant. the mean of entrepreneurs supported with grant was higher (5.00) than the mean of entrepreneurs supported by loan (4.55) for item 9 - mentor entrepreneurs are successful entrepreneurs with practical experience). The mean of those supported with loan was higher than the mean obtained for those supported with grant for the rest of the five items (apprentices are resilient, emerging entrepreneurs to form a network, apprentice should work in mentor's establishment on full time, apprentice should contribute to growth of mentor's business, first and last meetings of mentor and apprentice to be coordinated and attended by programme organisers). It is easily noticed that the mean of those supported with grant was higher only in an item that has to do with what is expected of a mentor. Their means were, however lower on items on features related to what is expected of apprentices.

Conclusion

No matter how innovative and commendable a solution sounds, it cannot work for a people if it is completely divorced from their central philosophy and manner of being. Therefore, in designing modern entrepreneurship development programmes for African nations, it is important to be innovative and to explore solutions that have worked in other places but those solutions need to be properly customized by integrating features that are inherent (not man-made) in the people such as communality/sharing; support for one another, hardwork, activeness, strength and dependability in order to boost the success rate of the programmes. This study identified the complementarity features that will boost success if integrated and has recommended a framework for the integration into entrepreneurship development programmes. Since a primitive system such as the Igbo apprenticeship system benefit from complementarity, it is anticipated that a more carefully articulated programme designed by business experts that integrates complementarity will produce even greater outcomes.

Recommendations

Based on the findings of the study, a framework has been developed which programme coordinators could follow to integrate the identified complementarity features into their programmes to enable them raise successful entrepreneurs. Figure 1 presents the framework

Phases	**Definition of Goals and Roles**	**Selection and Preparation of Participants**	**Nurturing Aspiring Entrepreneurs**	**Evaluation of Apprentice for Funding**	**Post-Funding support**
Aim	**Define clear and motivating goals**	**Enrol people that can perform their roles & benefit from the programme**	**Equip aspiring entrepreneurs with adequate competencies required to succeed.**	**Select the most promising candidates based on practical evidence**	**Ensure stability, build a community that cares**
features	▪ Set clear goals that are not Ambitious and challenging but realistic ▪ Prepare •mentoring memorandum of understanding •Templates reports and logs •Monitoring and evaluation form •Develop Plans, performance indicators and success criteria with qualitative and quantitative evidence	▪ Select apprentice who have genuine interest in entrepreneurship. They should also be resilient, hardworking and teachable. ▪ Identify and engage mentor entrepreneurs who are successful in their businesses and have practical skill and experience in business. ▪ Engage only mentor entrepreneurs who are willing to nurture an apprentice ▪ Conduct separate workshops for mentor entrepreneurs and to apprentices to prepare them for the programme	▪ identify and match qualified apprentice with a mentor entrepreneur whose business is in apprentice's area of interest ▪ Ensure apprentice works with mentor entrepreneur in his/her firm on full-time for 18 - 24 months under a Chief Executive Officer ▪ Ensure that apprentice is exposed to all aspects of the business including managerial and leadership roles ▪ Request that apprentice make remarkable contributions to the growth of the mentor's business	▪ Substantiated negative reports (such as theft and truancy) on apprentice terminates the programme ▪ Consider report on apprentice from mentor entrepreneur as major input in considering apprentice for funding ▪ Reports on the apprentice should show evidence of candidate 's ability to manage his/her proposed business in order to qualify for funding ▪ Compare reports with plans and KPIs	•Ensure mentor entrepreneurs continue to support their apprentice until they find their feet in their businesses •Ensure new entrepreneurs join the Business Mentor network to participate in mentoring up-coming entrepreneurs, provide feedback and making inputs to designing new entrepreneurship development programmes
Requirement	**Sincerity; planning workshops; stakeholder sensitisation**	**Personality tests; meritocracy; sound data management system; workshops**	**Job rotation, effective monitoring, Clear reports; ICT; Feedback**	**Report analysis**	**Follow-up; research; Networking knowledge; report writing**

Figure 1: Complementarity features of the apprenticeship programme for integration into entrepreneurship development programmes in Africa

In implementing the framework, it is recommended for stakeholders to note the following:

1. Programme organisers can make goals can be made motivating by making it moderately challenging. Unambiguity can be overcome by making goals specific, measurable and time-bound as well as and moving programmes away from social activities that can cause misunderstanding of progamme objectives such as election campaigns.
2. Programme coordinators need to be more sincerely committed to achieving entrepreneurship development programme goals. Selection of qualified trainees and mentors is important because the quality of the individuals selected for the programme, to a large extent, determines how

successful other activities (such as training) and the overall outcome will be.

3. Programme coordinators need to give adequate support to the trainees they selected beyond giving them money. They need to follow the candidates as they progress and provide necessary support. Documentation and sharing of trainee progress reports is necessary not only to keep stakeholders informed but also to keep trainees motivated.
4. Programme organisers need to consider practical skills learning is very important for helping young entrepreneurs succeed. Online training or/and classroom training is not enough to prepare people for doing practical business. Candidates need to be exposed to practical business education; they need to be in the real business environment and learning under an established businessman for at least 18 months. Methods such as job rotation, mentoring and executive exposure could be used to expose the Apprentice to different aspects of the business including management and leadership roles.
5. Apprentice should be expected to learn and show that he/she has learnt and that he/she is entrepreneurial by making significant contributions to master. There is need for programme organisers to determine for each candidate, what constitutes a significant contribution. Performance rubrics need to be developed and shared with the trainees so that they too can direct themselves to the highest performance without much external intervention.
6. Quality of relationship between mentor entrepreneur and apprentice is critical because it determines how much the mentor will be willing to give to the apprentice in terms of training). Thus Organisers should help in ensuring good relationships by (1) organize a training programme for Mentor entrepreneur's ad a separate training programme for apprentice with content that is targeted at building strong relationships. For example, they need to be told the reasons for the programmes, the benefits, the rules as well as tips on how they can (2) match mentor entrepreneurs and apprentices with certain factors in mind such as Organisers of the programme should match Mentor entrepreneurs and Apprentices who can work together. Information about their personalities and interests can be gathered using a questionnaire during the training programme to aid the matching.
7. Trainees should be humble enough to learn. They should make their mentors feel (not just hear) that they are loyal readiness to serve their mentors.

Suggestions for Further Studies

1. The framework recommended in this study should be trial-tested on small entrepreneurship development projects
2. The study should be expanded to get opinions of other young entrepreneurs operating their businesses in other parts of Nigeria.

References

Agozino, B. & Anyanike, I. (2007). Imu ahia: Traditional Igbo business school and global commerce culture. *Dialectical Anthropology*. *31*(1-3), 233-252.

Akpedji, G. (2015, November 7). YouWiN awardees protest nonpayment of second third trenches. *Guardian Newspaper*. Retrieved from http://www.ngrguardiannews.com

Aleke, M. (2018, July 31). The Igbo apprenticeship system that builds wealth and started the incubation system. *Pulse.ng*. Retrieved from https://www.pulse.ng/gist/imu-ahia-the-igbo-apprenticeship-system-that-builds-wealth-and-started-the-incubation/q50ps44

Bank of Industry. (2018). *Bank of Industry (BOI) Graduate Entrepreneurship Fund (GEF) for NYSC members.* Retrieved from https://www.boi.ng/bank-of-industry-boi-graduate-entrepreneurship-fund-gef-for-nysc-members/

Bank of Industry. (2018). *Youth Entrepreneurship Support (YES)*. Retrieved from https://www.boi.ng/yes/

Blattman, C., Fiala, N., & Martinez, S. (2014). Generating skilled self employment in developing countries: Experimental evidence from Uganda. *Quarterly Journal of Economics 129*(2), 697-752. Retrieved from https://www.povertyactionlab.org/sites/default/files/publications/992%20Skilled%20Self%20Employment%20in%20Urganda.pdf

Center for entrepreneurship and innovation, University of Ibadan. (2017). *Youth enterprise with innovation in Nigeria*. Retrieved from https://cei.ui.edu.ng/youth-enterprise-innovation-nigeria-youwin

Chattered Management Institute. (2014). *Setting SMART Objectives Checklist 231.* Retrieved from https://www.managers.org.uk/~/media/Files/Checklists/CHK-231-Setting_Smart_Objectives.pdf

Chinweuba, G. E., & Ezeugwu, E. C. (2017). The ontological foundation of Igbo entrepreneurship: An analytical investigation. *Journal of Philosophy, Culture and Religion. 33*. Retrieved from www.iiste.org

Chrisent, G. (2019). *What is Imuahia/Igba boy: What the Igbo apprenticeship is, history, thought and terms.* Retrieved from https://www.entorm.com/opinion/imu-ahia-the-igbo-apprenticeship.

Collins, A., Brown, J. S., & Newman, S. E. (1989). Cognitive apprenticeship: Teaching the craft of reading, writing, and mathematics. In L. B. Resnick (Ed.), *In knowing, learning, and instruction: Essays in honor of Robert Glase*r (pp. 453-494). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Fafchamps, M., & Woodruff, C. (2017). *Identifying gazelles: Expert panels vs. surveys as a means to identify firms with rapid growth potential* (Rev. ed.). World Bank Econ.

FME. (2013). *Effective goal setting: Productivity skills* (e-book). Retrieved from https://sclaa.com.au/wp-content/uploads/2015/03/Effective-Goal-Setting.pdf

Harbison, J. R. & Peke, P. (1998). *Smart Alliances*. San Francisco: Jorsey-Bass Press

Harrison, J. S., Hitt, M. A., Hoskisson, R. E., & Ireland, R. D. (2000). Resource complementarity in business combinations: Extending the logic to organizational alliances. *Journal of Management*. *27*(6), 679-690. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.1016/S0149-2063(01)00118-0

Iwara, I. O., Amaechi, K. E., & Netshandama, V. (2019). The Igba-boi apprenticeship approach: Arsenal behind growing success of Igbo entrepreneurs in Nigeria. *Ubuntu Journal of Conflict and Social Transformation.* 227-250. DOI: 10.31920/2050-4950/2019/SIn1a13

Kanu, I. A. (2017). Sources of igwebuike philosophy: Towards a socio-cultural foundation. *International Journal of Religion & Human Relations*. *9*(1), 1-23. Retrieved from https://www.ajol.info/index.php/jrhr/article/view/180084

Kanu I. A. (2017). Igwebuikeconomics: Towards an inclusive economy for economic development. *Igwebuike: An African Journal of Arts and Humanities. Vol. 3. No. 6.* 113-140.

Kanu I. A. (2017). Sources of *Igwebuike* Philosophy. *International Journal of Religion and Human Relations.* 9. 1. pp. 1-23.

Kanu, A. I. (2016a). *Igwebuike* as a trend in African philosophy. *IGWEBUIKE: An African Journal of Arts and Humanities. 2. 1.* 97-101.

Kanu, A. I. (2017c). *Igwebuike* as an Igbo-African philosophy of inclusive leadership. *Igwebuike: An African Journal of Arts and Humanities.* Vol. 3 No 7. pp. 165-183.

Kanu, A. I. (2017d). *Igwebuike* philosophy and the issue of national development. *Igwebuike: An African Journal of Arts and Humanities.* Vol. 3 No 6. pp. 16-50.

Kanu, A. I. (2017f). *Igwebuike* as an Igbo-African Ethic of Reciprocity. *IGWEBUIKE: An African Journal of Arts and Humanities. 3. 2. pp.* 153-160.

Kanu, I. A. (2016a). *Igwebuike* as an Igbo-African Hermeneutics of Globalisation. *IGWEBUIKE: An African Journal of Arts and Humanities*, Vol. 2 No.1. pp. 61-66.

Kanu, I. A. (2016a). *Igwebuike* as the consummate foundation of African Bioethical principles. *An African journal of Arts and Humanities* Vol.2 No1 June, pp.23-40.

Kanu, I. A. (2016b) *Igwebuike* as an Expressive Modality of Being in African ontology. *Journal of Environmental and Construction Management. 6. 3.* pp.12-21.

Kanu, I. A. (2017b). *Igwebuike* as a wholistic Response to the Problem of Evil and Human Suffering. *Igwebuike: An African Journal of Arts and Humanities*. Vol. 3 No 2, March.

Kanu, I. A. (2017e). *Igwebuike* as an Igbo-African modality of peace and conflict resolution. *Journal of African Traditional Religion and Philosophy Scholars. Vol. 1. No. 1. pp. 31-40*.

Kanu, I. A. (2017g). *Igwebuike* and the logic (Nka) of African philosophy. *Igwebuike: An African Journal of Arts and Humanities.* 3. 1. pp. 1-13.

Kanu, I. A. (2017h). *Igwebuike* Philosophy and Human Rights Violation in Africa. *IGWEBUIKE: An African Journal of Arts and Humanities.* Vol. 3. No. 7. pp. 117-136.

Kopf, D. (2018). *Giving poor people cash is a good idea. Giving entrepreneurs cash might be a great one.* Retrieved from https://qz.com/africa/1327833/kenya-is-following-nigeria-in-running-a-massive-business-plan-competition/

Lang, N. (2019). *The importance of collaboration in connected world*. Retrieved from https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2019/01/how-collaboration-is-the-modern-company-s-secret-weapon/

Majava, J., Isoherranen, V., & Kess, P. (2013). Business collaboration concepts and implications for companies. *International Journal of Synergy and*

Research. *2*(1), 23–40. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/270451729_Business_Collaboration_Concepts_and_Implications_for_Companies

Maliga, S. (2013). *Igbos dominate economically in Lagos because Yorubas are lazy.* Retrieved from elombah.com

Maxwel, J. C. (2007). *Talent is never enough*. Nashville: Thomas Nelson Press.

McKenzie, D. (2015). *Identifying and spurring high-growth entrepreneurship experimental evidence from a business plan competition*. Retrieved from https://www.pdfnigeria.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/04/YouWiN-Impact-Assessment-Report-David-M-1.pdf

McKenzie, D. (2017). *Report on Youwin! Long-term follow-up survey*. Retrieved from https://www.pdfnigeria.org/wpcontent/uploads/2018/05/ReportonLongTermFollowup-vs-0.1.pdf

McKenzie, D., & Sansone, D. (2019). Predicting entrepreneurial success is hard: Evidence from a business plan competition in Nigeria. *Journal of Development Economics*. *141*. DOI: 10.1016/j.jdeveco.2019.07.002

Meinert, D. (2017). *How to Improve Teamwork*. Retrieved from https://www.shrm.org/hr-today/news/hr-magazine/0217/pages/how-to-improve-teamwork.aspx

Moussa, M., Boyer, M., & Newberry, D. (2016). *Committed teams: Three steps to inspiring passion and performance.* USA: John Wiley & Sons.

Neuwirth, R. (2017). *The age-old sharing economies of Africa - and why we should scale them.* Retrieved from https://www.ted.com/talks/robert_neuwirth_the_age_old_sharing_economies_of_africa_and_why_we_should_scale_them/transcript?language=en

Nwafor. (2018, November 13). Depoliticizing the tradermoni scheme. *Vanguard Newspaper.* Retrieved from https://www.vanguardngr.com/2018/11/depoliticising-the-trader-moni-scheme/

Obanya, (2016). *Post-2015 education start–off for Nigeria: Lessons from EFA Global Monitoring Report – 2015. Discourse on the state of Education in Nigeria*. Ibadan: Laurel Educational Press.

Obunike, L.C. (2016). Induction strategy of Igbo entrepreneurs and micro-business success: A study of household equipment line, main market Onitsha, Nigeria. *ActaUniversitiesSapientiae, Economics and Business, 4*(1), 43-65.

Odiji, O., Nwoke, O., & Adeseke, A. (2016). Entrepreneurship programme and national development in Nigeria. *International Journal of Economic Development Research and Investment. 7(*1), 8-15. Retrieved from https://www.icidr.org/ijedri-vol7no1april2016/The%20YouWiN%20Entrepreneurship%20Programme%20and%20National%20Development%20in%20Nigeria.pdf

OFA. (2019). *MbeleNaBiz business plan competition 2019 for young Kenyans (Grant of Ksh 900,000 or Ksh 3,600,000).* Retrieved from https://www.opportunitiesforafricans.com/mbelenabiz-business-plan-competition-2019/

Ogbeiwi, O. (2017). Why written objectives need to be really SMART. *British Journal of Health Care Management 23*(7), 324-336. · Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/318390296_Why_written_objectives_need_to_be_really_SMART

Okogba, E. (2019, February 16). 91 million Nigerians now live in extreme poverty – World Poverty Clock. *Vanguard Newspaper*. Retrieved from https://www.vanguardngr.com/2019/02/91-million-nigerians-now-live-in-extreme-poverty-world-poverty-clock/

Okoro, C. (2018, November 7). What makes the Igbo apprenticeship model tick and critical considerations before taking it mainstream. *Techpoint.africa.* Retrieved from https://techpoint.africa/2018/11/07/igbo-apprenticeship-system-for-startups/

Olagunju, W. (2016). *Opening of the five-day in-class capacity building session of the youth entrepreneurship support (YES) programme*. Retrieved from https://www.boi.ng/yes-programme-in-class-mds-speech/

Olawoyin, O. (2017, February 16). Buhari govt set to launch repackaged job creation initiative, YouWin. *Premium Times.* Retrieved from https://www.premiumtimesng.com/news/headlines/223717-buhari-govt-set-launch-repackaged-job-creation-initiative-youwin.html

Olutayo, O. A. (1999), The Igbo entrepreneur in the political economy of Nigeria. *African study monographs*. *20*, 147-174.

Oniyitan, O. (2012). *Federal Government Unveils YouWin 2 for Women*. Retrieved from http://w-hbs.com/youwin-women/

Onuba, I. (2016, May 15). FG begins audit of YouWIN beneficiaries. *Punch News Paper.* Retrieved from https://punchng.com/fg-begins-audit-youwin-beneficiaries/

Onwuka, A. (2015). *The Igbo and culture of Apprenticeship*. Retrieved from http://www.nairaland.com/2790354/igbo-culture-apprenticeship

Orugun, J. J., & Nafiu, A. T. (2014). An exploratory study of Igbo entrepreneurial activity and business success in Nigeria as the panacea for economic growth and development. *International Journal of Scientific & Technology Research.* *3*(9), 158-165. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/317388707_An_Exploratory_Study_Of_Igbo_Entrepreneurial_Activity_And_Business_Success_In_Nigeria_As_The_Panacea_For_Economic_Growth_And_Development

Patel, S. (2013). *The truth about hard work and entrepreneurial success*. Retrieved from https://sujanpatel.com/business/the-truth-about-hard-work-and-entrepreneurial-success/

Premium times. (2018). *Nigerian Government pays N11 billion to YouWin awardees*. Retrieved from https://www.premiumtimesng.com/news/top-news/255773-nigerian-govt-pays-n11-billion-youwin-awardees.html

Sari, J. (2018). *Locke's goal-setting theory*. Retrieved from https://www.toolshero.com/time-management/edwin-locke-goal-setting-theory/

SHRM. (2019). *Developing and Sustaining High-Performance Work Teams*. Retrieved from https://www.shrm.org/resourcesandtools/tools-and-samples/toolkits/pages/developingandsustaininghigh-performanceworkteams.aspx

The Economist Intelligence Unit. (2008). *The role of trust in business collaboration: An Economist Intelligence Unit briefing paper sponsored by Cisco Systems*. Retrieved from https://graphics.eiu.com/upload/cisco_trust.pdf

TraderMoni. (2018). *Grow big*. Retrieved from https://www.tradermoni.ng/about.html

Ukaegbu, C. C. (2003). Entrepreneurial succession and post-founder durability: A study of indigenous private manufacturing firms in Igbo States of Nigeria. *Journal of Contemporary African Affairs*. *21*(1), 27–45.

Vaillant, G. E. (2003). *Aging well: Surprising guideposts to a happier life from the Landmark Harvard Study of Adult Development*. USA: Little Brown and Company.

Whitmore, J. (2002). *Coaching for Performance* (3rd ed.). Boston: Nicholas Brealey Press.

Young, J. (2017, December 13). Heroes of employee engagement: No.4 Edwin A. Locke (Blog Post) Retrieved from https://peakon.com/blog/future-work/edwin-locke-goal-setting-theory/